

BACKGROUND AND



RECOMMENDATIONS

APPRENTICESHIP: TRAINING THAT WORKS

SUSAN CRANE AND JOHN COLBORN
WORKFORCE MATTERS AND ASPEN INSTITUTE



**“WHAT INTERESTED ME WAS THAT THE
MAN HAS ACTUALLY PLACED OVER A
THOUSAND YOUNG PEOPLE IN VARIOUS
CAREERS WITHOUT DISPLACING ANYONE,
FOR IN EACH CASE HE ASKED THAT NEW
WORK BE CREATED FOR THE APPLICANT
AND IN ALMOST EVERY CASE WHEN THE
APPRENTICESHIP PERIOD WAS OVER,
IT RESULTED IN A REAL JOB.”**

ELEANOR ROOSEVELT, JANUARY 19, 1940

BACKGROUND

President Obama's investment of \$175 million in the American Apprenticeship Initiative grants represent the largest infusion of public funds ever invested in the U.S. apprenticeship system.

President Obama unveiled his apprenticeship initiative in 2014, with the challenge to double the number of apprentices in the U.S. to 750,000. The subsequent \$175 million American Apprenticeship Initiative grant program representing the largest infusion of public funds ever invested in the U.S. apprenticeship system. Coupled with a spate of investments in the U.S. by European companies, such as Siemens, Zurich Insurance, and BMW, apprenticeship is now getting a second look by a range of stakeholders, including community colleges, employers, funders, and others. Furthermore, workforce development professionals are starting to embrace apprenticeship because it epitomizes the "gold standard" in the field: employer-led training for real jobs, family-supporting wages, earn-while-you-learn opportunities, and in many locations, concomitant college credit.

Last February, a set of Foundations joined with the Aspen Institute, Workforce Matters, and the US Department of Labor to discuss the role of philanthropy in supporting the sustained growth of apprenticeships in the United States. This meeting concluded that apprenticeship, despite its longstanding practice, remains an embryonic field and that an 'eco-system' was needed to promote and grow the apprenticeship field. This ecosystem discussion clustered around four major areas:

Knowledge and Research: There is limited evidence to inform decision making and the spread of best practices. States do not have a ready way of sharing their efforts. Funders do not have a ready way of sharing strategies or learnings from their grant making. Educators, employers, and other practitioners



are only loosely connected to one another. And few have ready access to existing research gaps.

Marketing & Outreach: Resources are needed to provide messaging and marketing to employers and potential participants. Indeed, apprenticeship suffers from a range of misunderstandings and stigmas. Overcoming these challenges requires high-touch work with employers and better support for practitioners in their outreach and partnership-building efforts.

Advocacy & Policy: Apprenticeship remains challenged by a policy environment that has not kept pace with innovation in apprenticeships in terms of instruction, industry, or population focus. For example, despite ample evidence of the critical role of youth-focused apprenticeship activity, federal money for apprentices under 18 years old remains limited.

Capacity Building for Practitioners: Finally, the field lacks a capacity-building function and is instead characterized by splintered constituencies and an absence of identified models or benchmarks. This impedes the spread of innovation, increases costs of start-up and expansion of apprenticeship efforts, and undermines basic quality control.



REAL JOBS



COLLEGE CREDITS



HIGHER WAGES

STATE OF THE FIELD

Following on the February meeting, Workforce Matters did a scan of the field, with the goal to develop a robust set of proposals for consideration by the philanthropic community. In meetings with a range of stakeholders and leaders in the apprenticeship field, the authors sought to identify areas where coordinated investments of foundations could support high-leverage, actionable ideas that would grow apprenticeship and strengthen its impact on poor and marginalized populations.

The scan affirmed many of the conclusions reached at the February meeting. It also served to identify opportunities and dynamics within apprenticeship to further refine and focus strategies for philanthropic engagement. Key findings include:

STATE DYNAMICS

The federal and state systems of registered apprenticeship pose challenges and opportunities for growing the apprenticeship. Roughly, half of the states have authority from the U.S. Department

of Labor of registration and oversight of apprenticeship programs (known as State Apprenticeship Agency (SAA) states) and the others directly through the federal Office of Apprenticeship. Employers with apprentices in multiple states can register through the federal system. Positively, this “system” fosters opportunities for experimentation and innovation. However, it also means that focusing on the federal system alone is insufficient to support a national agenda.





FLEXIBILITY, QUALITY CONTROL, AND EQUITY CHALLENGES

Both state and federal apprenticeship offices have shown promise by adopting more flexible, employer-friendly, and performance-oriented approaches designed to increase significantly the incidence of apprenticeship in the U.S. Since the initiative began, the number of apprentices has grown from 375,000 to 445,000. Less clear, is how the increase in apprenticeship activity has advanced economic opportunity for poor and marginalized populations as no data is collected on this metric. In addition, there is limited capacity to attend to the ongoing quality and performance of an apprenticeship program.

NETWORKS OF ACTIVITY

Despite these challenges, an emerging set of networks are actively developing apprentice efforts. These include (a) the 46 grant recipients under the federal AIA; (b) the Aspen Institute's Forum for Community Solutions, which is actively cultivating apprenticeship pilots among its target communities; and (c) the National Fund for Workforce Solutions, which is contemplating an effort to test apprenticeship approaches in several of its communities. These networks offer opportunities to develop, test, and learn from apprenticeships in a range of contexts, geographies, institutions, and industries. Lastly, the Department of Labor, with its employer partners, has created Sectors of Excellence in Apprenticeship (SEAs), that function as sector councils in six industries: Healthcare, Advanced Manufacturing, IT, Transportation/Logistics, and Construction.

INTERVIEWS CONDUCTED

- **Doug MacLaren**, British Columbia Resource Training Organization (CEO emeritus)
- **Angela Hanks**, Center for American Progress
- **Nikki Evans**, City University of New York
- **Nikki Pagan**, Gateway Technical College
- **Angela Demetrio**, McKenzie
- **Fred Dedrick**, National Fund for Workforce Solutions
- **Andy Van Kleunen, Kermit Kaleba & Scott Ellsworth**, National Skills Coalition/Business Leaders United
- **Brett Halvorson et al**, New York City Workforce Funders Group
- **Ron Johnson**, DOLETA Apprenticeship (retired)/ consultant to Swiss government re: apprenticeship
- **Bryna Helfer**, USDOT
- **Crystal Bridgeman**, Siemens Foundation
- **Carla Whitlock**, Apprenticeship Carolina
- **Robert Lerman**, Urban Institute
- **David Langdon**, US Department of Commerce
- **John Ladd & Laura Ginsburg**, US Department of Labor
- **Artie Mandel**, US Senator Cantwell's Office
- And 14 interviews with business and labor organizations active in apprenticeship



FEDERAL AND STATE POLICY OPPORTUNITIES

While the most visible federal policy efforts have focused on expanding support for apprenticeship at the US Department of Labor, primarily through its special status for registered apprenticeship under WIOA, expanded use of Pell grants and work-study for apprentices, and funds under the GI bill, is promising. There are several legislative proposals pending that expand support of apprenticeship. In addition, a number of bills to grow apprenticeship have also been introduced at the state level. This heightened level of policy activity suggests there may be opportunities to help shape the policy discourse around apprenticeship.

EMPLOYER PERSPECTIVES

Though employer marketing and outreach challenges are real, there seems to be growing opportunities to engage employers in developing or expanding apprenticeship efforts in their companies. A recent survey found that 58% of successful companies were interested in developing or growing apprenticeships or sustain existing apprenticeship programs. In another survey, employers identified impediments to increased use of apprenticeship citing such factors as finance and cost issues (62%); a dearth of educational partners to support apprenticeship efforts (21%); a lack of industry-specific guidance (15%); and challenges to the process of registering apprenticeship programs (42%).

EXPERIMENTATION

Finally, Experimentation with new apprenticeship models is occurring throughout the country. This is exemplified by the South Carolina model, whereby the state community college system provides concierge service to employers—by helping them to register new apprenticeship programs, and support the inclusion of new apprenticeship delivery models, such as hybrid learning, and competency-based training. This combination of rapid change and new investment has further stimulated interest in apprenticeship; in areas such as preparation of under-skilled individuals so that they can qualify for apprenticeship and working with employers and training providers in new and different ways.

ACTIONS TO BUILD THE FIELD

Moving beyond sporadic and episodic success stories, however, will require a concerted set of field-building strategies that coordinate investments and activities across a range of organizations. The following pages review a set of activities recommended for consideration by the philanthropic community. The purpose of this paper is to lay out areas where partnership and investment of resources by philanthropy can help to amplify and move this work forward.

Key considerations for current and would-be philanthropic investors will revolve around:

■ READINESS

Is there institutional and field readiness to undertake particular actions?

■ SEQUENCING

What sequencing results in the highest impact in the field?

■ MATCHING FUNDER INTERESTS WITH ACTIVITIES

How might the recommended actions map to differing interests of funders?












■ COORDINATION










What institutional structures can help support coordination among funders and field actors?

The table on the following pages provides a high-level review of potential actions, which are discussed in additional detail.



POTENTIAL ACTIVITIES AND FIELD BUILDING STRATEGIES

	RESEARCH & KNOWLEDGE BUILDING	CAPACITY BUILDING	POLICY	MARKETING & COMMUNICATIONS	BUDGET
<p>\$: Under \$50,000 \$\$: Between \$50,000 and \$250,000 \$\$\$: Between \$250,000 and \$500,000 \$\$\$\$: \$500,000 or more</p>					
<p>HOLDING A NATIONAL CONFERENCE ON APPRENTICESHIP Plan and stage a national conference of cross-sectoral audiences to promote and strengthen apprenticeships.</p>					\$\$\$\$
<p>RESEARCHING AND DOCUMENTING APPRENTICESHIP MODELS AND PRACTICES Foster information sharing and undertake original research to grow the base of knowledge on apprenticeship practices in the United States.</p>					\$\$
<p>CREATING A RETURN ON INVESTMENT ANALYSIS Develop and field a return on investment analysis of apprenticeship programs (already underway) and promote the use of the ROI tool among a range of stakeholders.</p>					ALREADY FUNDED
<p>EXPLORING YOUTH APPRENTICESHIP Build upon White House, NFWS, and Aspen Forum for Community Solutions interest in developing and growing youth apprenticeship by undertaking a scan of existing efforts and testing new models.</p>					PILOT: \$\$ SITE/YEAR DOCUMENTATION AND SUPPORT: \$\$\$
<p>DEVELOPING CAPACITY BUILDING RESOURCES Assess state, federal, and private sector/nonprofit apprenticeship capacity building resources; create resource guide; develop and assess feasibility for strengthening network of capacity building resources. Develop introductory resources for those workforce and educational organizations considering apprenticeship strategies — packaging together an introductory guide, annotated bibliography, and capacity assessment tool.</p>					\$\$

<p> \$: Under \$50,000 \$\$: Between \$50,000 and \$250,000 \$\$\$: Between \$250,000 and \$500,000 \$\$\$\$: \$500,000 or more </p>					
<p> ASSESSING APPRENTICESHIP POLICY Document ways to leverage labor, education, veterans, and other federal funding streams as well as state resources in support of apprenticeship; develop a framework for state apprenticeship policy, assess federal policy proposals for apprenticeship. </p>					<p> \$\$ </p>
<p> CREATING A FUNDING POOL FOR INNOVATION AND TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE Areas of focus could include creating: registered apprenticeships: in nontraditional occupations, I-BEST apprenticeships for low-skilled apprentices, youth apprenticeships, and apprenticeship start-up assistance for employers. </p>					
<p> DEVELOPING A COMMUNICATIONS AND MARKETING STRATEGY Develop and field a return on investment analysis of apprenticeship Undertake polling and focus groups among employers, prospective apprenticeship populations, parents and other key stakeholders to test messaging most effective in promoting apprenticeship; develop recommendations and action plans for use by practitioners in promoting apprenticeship; undertake training for communications and outreach efforts. </p>					<p> PLANNING: \$\$ IMPLEMENTATION: \$\$\$ </p>
<p> AUGMENTING FEDERAL GRANT EFFORTS In coordination with the Department of Labor, support documentation and capacity building efforts designed to support federal grantees and to promote learning in the field from their experiences. </p>					<p> SIGNIFICANTLY FUNDED; ADDITIONAL SUPPORT (\$\$ – \$\$\$) </p>



HOLDING A NATIONAL CONFERENCE

Given the right set of circumstances, a national conference can be catalytic for the development of a field of practice. It can help foster new networks, disseminate critical ideas, and shine a national spotlight on an issue or practice—in short, it can help to build a movement. The circumstances of the field of apprenticeship may present just such an opportunity evidenced by growing interest in apprenticeship, opportunities to grow apprenticeship in new ways, infusions of new resources, and participation from a range of players.








A high-profile national conference of 400-600 people in the fall of 2016 would create an opportunity to...

- (a) Gather the federal American Apprenticeship Initiative grantees along with policy, practice, and research leaders and new entrants to the field;
- (b) Engage national and state policy leaders on apprenticeship;
- (c) Generate earned media to help promote apprenticeship more broadly;
- (d) Learn about European and Canadian apprenticeship models;
- (e) Build networks of relationships among stakeholders in the field including employers, educators, workforce development professionals, labor leaders, advocates, researchers and policy analysts;

- (f) Foster collaboration among a set of resource organizations in the field through the use of co-sponsorship and joint conference design across a range of organizations including employer, labor, workforce development, and advocacy groups; and
- (g) Disseminate new knowledge and perspectives on the field.

The timing is opportune in several ways. The federal grantees will be a year into their projects in the fall of 2016 – far enough along to have a sense of early lessons and challenges to be shared and addressed through a national

conference. (The National Governors Association expects to sponsor a brief meeting of grantees in 2016 and a larger gathering of federal grantees and other stakeholders in 2018.) The National Fund for Workforce Solution’s annual conference, the largest cross-sector workforce development conference in the country, will not be taking place in 2016 and so there will be opportunities to engage the National Fund network through this gathering. The conference will also allow stakeholders to identify and develop a policy agenda for a new congress and administration in 2017.

CATEGORIES	ESTIMATED BUDGET					
						
	\$\$\$\$: \$500,000 or more					
						
KEY ORGANIZATIONS						
Aspen Institute (Lead); National Governors Association, Urban Institute, National Fund for Workforce Solutions, National Skills Coalition, national labor and employer groups						
TIMELINE	1Q 16	2Q 16	3Q 16	4Q 16	1Q 17	2Q 17
	X	X	X	X		

CREATING A RETURN ON INVESTMENT ANALYSIS

Led by economists at Case Western Reserve University and the Department of Commerce, this study will offer valuable new data that can help interested employers understand how investing in apprenticeship can boost their bottom line and promote more widely shared prosperity.

This new study will be the first to quantify the benefit of apprenticeship to employers. From surveys, employers have already indicated they benefit from investing in apprenticeships. U.S. employers who sponsor apprentices report that they are able to build a pipeline of skilled workers, boost retention, reduce recruiting costs and improve productivity.

Employers in other countries reap a reward from their investment in training apprentices. In Canada, employers receive a benefit of \$1.47 for every \$1 spent on apprenticeship training. In Switzerland, employers spend around \$3.4 billion annually training apprentices but earn \$3.7 billion each year from apprentices' work during training. They also save on recruiting and employee relocation costs.

CATEGORIES



ESTIMATED BUDGET

ALREADY FUNDED

KEY ORGANIZATIONS

US Department of Commerce (Lead), Case Western Reserve



EXPLORING YOUTH APPRENTICESHIP

Young people in the United States face a series of challenges in connecting to economic and educational opportunities. High rates of young people not connected to work or education – especially young men of color – has fostered a growing consensus that younger people need a broader range of alternatives, in addition to more traditional college-oriented programs. Many funders and practitioners have begun to ask how apprenticeship might fit among these alternatives.

Youth apprenticeship in the United States is under-developed. While the European apprenticeship experience begins in secondary school, and includes systems where education and work experience articulate to career and educational pathways, apprenticeship in the United States is almost universally viewed as an adult-serving program.

Two networks of practitioners – the National Fund for Workforce Solutions and the Aspen Institute Opportunity Youth Forum – have begun exploring how apprenticeship might be better targeted to young people. Many high schools are likewise exploring how career exploration, work experience, and industry-recognized credentials can be better integrated into the high school curriculum. And national policy leaders, including the White House, have expressed interest

in growing the practice of youth-serving apprenticeship programs.

This emerging interest in youth apprenticeship deserves a more systematic exploration. In the absence of a defined model or approach, work in this area needs the selection of 6-10 sites around at once to foster experimentation with multiple strategies, coupled with a rigorous effort to document and learn from on-the-ground experiences. Site-based work connected to national networks

would seem to offer the best opportunity to achieve these dual aims.

This work stream would involve the selection of 6-10 sites around the country, support for local coordinators who would work to design and implement youth-serving apprenticeship programs, and a national documentation effort that would track these experiences and develop lessons guidance for the field.

CATEGORIES



ESTIMATED BUDGET



Site-based support

\$\$: Between \$50,000 and \$250,000



Documentation and capacity building

\$\$\$+: More than \$250,000

KEY ORGANIZATIONS

National Fund for Workforce Solutions, Aspen Institute Forum for Community Solutions, Aspen Institute, Jobs for the Future

TIMELINE

1Q 16
PLANNING

2Q 16
X

3Q 16
X

4Q 16
X

1Q 17
X

2Q 17
X

DEVELOPING CAPACITY BUILDING RESOURCES

With the growing interest in apprenticeship, many want to understand how they might develop or grow apprenticeship programs. Employers want to understand how it works; workforce development professionals and community college staff want to know how they can participate. In response, think tanks like the Center for American Progress and the Urban Institute are publishing policy and practice reports. Siemens, which has recently expanded its manufacturing activity in the U.S., has published an Employer's Playbook for Building an Apprenticeship Program.

A number of organizations—such as the National Governor's Association and Mayer and Mayer—will be providing training and technical assistance to those entities that receive American Apprenticeship Initiative grants. There are also governmental resources that can be of assistance, including the US Department of Labor's Apprenticeship website and its regional staff and state apprenticeship agencies and publications. There are also non-profit and for-profit consultants who provide assistance locally, and/or nationally.

These resources, however, are not always easy to identify and no one has done any sort of census of resources. Activities in this work stream might include:

- A. Create a capacity building resource map, including an assessment of federal, state, private sector/nonprofit apprenticeship capacity building resources. Identify a set of technical assistance providers who can provide assistance to grant makers and practitioners regarding creating and packaging new apprenticeship programs.
- B. Commission a set of apprenticeship "how-to guides" for workforce development professionals, community colleges, employers, and workforce organizations considering apprenticeship strategies—packaging together an introductory guide, annotated bibliography, and capacity assessment tools.
- C. Identify public sector capacity building needs and capabilities of State Apprenticeship Agencies and federal officials.

CATEGORIES



ESTIMATED BUDGET



\$\$: Between \$50,000 and \$250,000

KEY ORGANIZATIONS

National Governors Association, Urban Institute, Center for American Progress, Aspen Institute

TIMELINE	1Q 16	2Q 16	3Q 16	4Q 16	1Q 17	2Q 17
PLANNING		X	X	X	X	X

APPRENTICESHIP POLICY

The federal government’s recent \$175M American Apprenticeship Grant has reinvigorated a system that has long been under the radar. There are increasing opportunities to leverage and knit together federal funding streams to build apprenticeship. The Department of Labor and the Department of Education have been working together closely to grow apprenticeship. Other departments, such as Veterans Affairs, Transportation, and Commerce have also been involved.

Further options for governmental systems integration is another area worthy of focus. Philanthropy can assist by ensuring that apprenticeship expands opportunity for disadvantaged populations. Apprenticeship supports used by other countries, such as employer tax credits and wage subsidies, systems integration approaches across various governmental agencies, and the public sector’s role in promoting and facilitating the expansion of apprenticeship are also worthy of exploration.

Several bi-partisan apprenticeship bills have been introduced in Congress. Senators Booker and Scott recently introduced the LEAP Act, which was modeled after South Carolina’s apprenticeship tax credit

program. Senators Cantwell, Collins, Gillibrand and Kaine have introduced the Apprenticeship and Jobs Training Act of 2015. This bill combines tax credits for employers who hire apprentices, advanced placement credit for veterans who obtained relevant skills in the military, and early retirement for workers over 55 years old if they mentor or train new employees. A third bill, the PACE Act, will provide a regular appropriation for apprenticeship. The bill, which is sponsored by Senator Murray, and Representatives Pocan and Miller, will make firmer connections between the workforce system, apprenticeship, secondary and post-

secondary education. In Indiana, for example, all apprentices who journey out (and who complete their Gen. Ed. requirements) receive A.A.S. degree. Several federal agencies are supporting apprenticeship. For example, a little-known funding source that can be used at the state level allows state transportation directors to use a portion of their federal highway construction capital funds to support training and support services for disadvantaged populations—focusing on women, minorities, and the disabled. At this point, three states (Oregon, Washington, and Maryland) have legislated use of these funds.

CATEGORIES



ESTIMATED BUDGET



\$\$: Between \$50,000 and \$250,000

KEY ORGANIZATIONS

National Skills Coalition, National Governors Association

TIMELINE

1Q 16	2Q 16	3Q 16	4Q 16	1Q 17	2Q 17
X	X	X	X	X	X

DEVELOPING A COMMUNICATIONS AND MARKETING STRATEGY

While apprenticeship has been available in the United States since the 1930s, it is still an underutilized training system in our country. Moreover, apprenticeship in the U.S. has typically been the province of the construction trades, which currently constitute about 80% of the 440,000 registered apprentices in the United States. By comparison, with a population that is one-fifth the size of the U.S., the U.K. currently has more than two million apprentices, and is on track to grow one million additional apprenticeships by 2020. If the United States is to take registered apprenticeship to scale, myths about apprenticeship such as “it’s only for the building trades” or “it’s a union strategy” need to be confronted. The value of apprenticeship to employers and apprentices needs to be highlighted.

Developing a strategy and set of messages for promoting apprenticeship requires a better understanding of the targeted stakeholders and the tools best suited to reach them. Such a communications and marketing strategy could be developed by engaging a strategic communications resource to undertake polling and focus groups among employers, prospective

apprenticeship populations, parents and other key stakeholders to develop a test messaging most effective in promoting apprenticeship. This process would also entail a media analysis and an assessment of current efforts and gaps in marketing and outreach.

With this data in-hand, the communications analysis could outline effective messages and outreach strategies. Advocates, practitioners, and public officials could be trained, and a tool kit in support of apprenticeship marketing and communications efforts could be developed.

CATEGORIES



ESTIMATED BUDGET



\$\$\$: More than \$250,000

KEY ORGANIZATIONS

Aspen Institute (lead); US Department of Labor, National Governors Association, Urban Institute, National Fund for Workforce Solutions, National Skills Coalition

TIMELINE

	1Q 16	2Q 16	3Q 16	4Q 16	1Q 17	2Q 17
		X	X	X	X	X

AUGMENTING FEDERAL GRANT EFFORTS

With over \$170 million in grants and an ambition to add tens of thousands of apprentices to the US system, the American Apprenticeship Initiative represents the single largest investment in apprenticeship in US history. These grants represent an important opportunity to understand how apprenticeship can be applied in less traditional industries, how apprenticeship can expand economic opportunity for targeted populations, and how apprenticeship can be scaled.

The National Governors Association has already received funding from the Siemens Foundation to support and augment the federal grants with convenings, technical assistance, and other activities – particularly targeting state government grantees and state partners in the federal grants. In addition, the federal effort will include support for Meyer and Meyer to provide technical assistance. Finally, evaluation efforts at the grant level and across grantees will be funded.

There is, however, a potentially high-leverage opportunity to further augment the federal grant efforts with additional documentation and capacity building resources designed to enhance outcomes and promote learning in the field based on the experiences of federal

grantees. This work might include supplemental support to individual grantees for technical assistance or documentation activities as well as national resources to create case studies, cross-site analysis of particular issues (such as targeting particular populations), and supplemental technical assistance efforts around emerging needs of the grantees.



CATEGORIES



ESTIMATED BUDGET



SIGNIFICANTLY FUNDED:
Additional support

KEY ORGANIZATIONS

National Governors Association, Urban Institute, Aspen Institute

TIMELINE	1Q 16	2Q 16	3Q 16	4Q 16	1Q 17	2Q 17
	X	X	X	X	X	X

BUILDING APPRENTICESHIP

The activities and initiatives described above represent critical steps to building and scaling an apprenticeship field of practice. However, field building requires more than a collection of activities – it requires a sense of shared direction and collaborative strategy across a range of actors.

As noted in the original discussion primer, workforce development funders have from time to time identified field building challenges and come together to create systemic solutions to those challenges. Philanthropy did so by creating evaluation capacity in the field (MDRC), by fostering sectoral workforce development practices (which would become the basis of job-driven strategies now driving virtually all workforce development policy and best practice), by forming a national workforce policy organization (The National Skills Coalition), and by creating a funding infrastructure for supporting workforce intermediaries (the National Fund for Workforce Solutions). The architecture of the workforce development field today is stronger because of these systematic and coordinated efforts.

Building a field of apprenticeship will likewise require a concerted strategy among a range of stakeholders, with critical leadership and resources from philanthropic actors. This strategy should include...

- A. An orchestrated and sequenced set of activities** (like those enumerated above) that serves to build networks and fosters the development of national and/or regional organizational capacity that match the needs of a robustly supported set of on-the-ground efforts.
- B. A center of gravity** – either in one organization or shared across a limited set of organizations – that can help set and advance an explicit field-building agenda.
- C. A communications capacity** that can help describe the field, grow its capacity to engage key stakeholders, and equip practitioners and field actors with data, stories, and language to enhance their voices.

A robust field building strategy can and should evolve over time. The activities described above are intended to offer opportunities to test field-building assumptions and test potential roles for particular organizations in this work.





APPENDICES

FUNDER MEETING ON APPRENTICESHIPS NOTES SUMMARY

Monday, February 2, 2015

LIMITING FACTORS/POTENTIAL CATALYSTS: WHAT'S MISSING?

The first part of the discussion focused on what is missing from the 'eco-system' to promote and grow the apprenticeship field. Discussion clustered around four major areas:

MISSING ELEMENTS	WHAT IS NEEDED?
KNOWLEDGE CENTER	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ What states are doing what? What states have apprenticeship offices? ▪ How can funders learn from each other? ▪ Connecting with educators (secondary and post-secondary systems) ▪ What research exists? What research needs to be done?
MARKETING & OUTREACH	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Solid messaging and marketing to employers and potential participants ▪ Ways to get beyond stigma ▪ High-touch work with employers ▪ Bringing them to the table early on as partners ▪ Understanding why employers are hesitant (job at the end; cost; reporting; union fears; etc)
ADVOCACY & POLICY	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Pre-apprenticeship on-ramps ▪ Policy development ▪ No federal money for under 18
CAPACITY BUILDING FOR PRACTITIONERS	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Splintered constituencies ▪ Better definitions of models

INTERESTS OF FUNDERS PARTICIPATING IN THE MEETING

PLACE-BASED INTERESTS

PLACE	INTEREST
NEW YORK	Healthcare, Tech Talent Pipeline, Youth
PHILADELPHIA	Meeting Feb 3
BALTIMORE	Meeting on Feb 6 to discuss, STRIVE model
FAIRFIELD, CONNECTICUT	Meeting with state leaders soon
CINCINNATI, OHIO	IT and Manufacturing
ALABAMA	Cyber-security, IT Healthcare

PROGRAMMATIC INTERESTS

PARTICIPANTS	INTEREST AREAS	YOUTH
Carrie Braddock <i>Centerbridge Foundation</i>	focused on education; career access; charter schools	X
Crystal Bridgeman <i>Siemens Foundation</i>	key elements that make apprenticeships work; how to expand for youth and adults; how to provide both in-school and out-of-school opportunities; how to make programs scalable	X
Karen Brown <i>Fairfield County Community Foundation</i>	Thrive by 25; opportunity youth; new employer sectors such as digital media	X
Laurie Dien <i>The Pinkerton Foundation</i>	interested in high school based apprenticeships	X
Mindy Feldbaum <i>ACT Foundation</i>	interested in young adults; continuums of work-learning-living; concerned about lack of systems; interested in other sectors such as retail; works with National Network of Business Partnerships; what can we learn from TAACT experience	X X
Yancy Garrido <i>The Clark Foundation</i>	interested in employment, education and social services; moving people out of poverty; heavily involved in NY Workforce Funders workforce white paper; encouraged group to not forget about non-profit employers	
Allison Gerber <i>The Annie E. Casey Foundation</i>	interested in work-based learning for youth; ways apprenticeships could align with NFWS	X
Alice Goh <i>The Ford Foundation</i>	looking at youth unemployment in Africa	X
Michelle Henry <i>JPMorgan Chase</i>	non-traditional sectors; Detroit – construction and advanced manufacturing; Miami – trade and logistics	
Roderick Jenkins <i>The New York Community Trust</i>	interested in all aspects of apprenticeship; traditional, formerly incarcerated and youth; interested in policy dimensions; also Career and Technical Education high schools (CTE)	X
Ryan Kelsey <i>Helmsley Charitable Trust</i>	how to align apprenticeships with Helmsley interest in post-secondary STEM; how do apprenticeships promote upward mobility: what works; and are there STEM-tech areas for apprenticeships	
Betsy Krebs <i>JPB Foundation</i>	interested in apprenticeships as an anti-poverty solution	
James McCrary Community Foundation of Greater Birmingham	part of state workforce council; interested in high school level apprenticeships; construction trades; working with Mercedes-Benz and other industrial partners; came to learn more	
Helen Neuborne <i>The Ford Foundation</i>	Leads team with Laine and Alice	
Julie Peller <i>Lumina Foundation</i> Laine Romero-Alston <i>The Ford Foundation</i>	federal policy dimensions; alignment with post-secondary attainment; how apprenticeships integrate with other systems; policy and advocacy dimensions thinking about next generation workforce strategies especially for low income and immigrant populations; interested in home care; retail; hospitality; focused on raising the floor and building the ladders	
Whitney Smith <i>The Joyce Foundation</i>	focused on underprepared adults; have new joint fund for education and employment	
Jennie Sparandara <i>Job Opportunity Investment Network</i>	interested in apprenticeships for young adults and opportunity youth; ways to think about apprenticeships beyond advanced manufacturing and health	X
Melanie Styles <i>Abell Foundation</i>	how apprenticeship could align with sector-based training efforts in Baltimore; youth apprenticeship; how to build on CTE models	X
Sandra Tamer	just setting up a foundation; came to learn more	
Stephen Tucker <i>United Way of Greater Cincinnati</i>	concerned about lack of use of apprenticeships in Ohio; thinking about how apprenticeships are part of the talent pipeline; ways to leverage resources to expand the model	
Janice Urbanik <i>United Way of Greater Cincinnati</i>	how to adapt the model for opportunity youth; what are the place-based dimensions for apprenticeships	X
Deborah Velazquez <i>Altman Foundation</i>	looking at apprenticeships vis-à-vis opportunity youth; and populations with barriers to employment	X

